



**American Journal of Educational Research and Reviews**  
(ISSN:2474-9265)



## Article Critique: “The Relationship between Transformational Leadership and Job Satisfaction”

Eshetu Kibret Emiru

Debre Markos University

### ABSTRACT

This paper provides a critical review of the article published under the title of “The relationship between transformational leadership and job satisfaction”. The reviewed article intended to determine the relationship between transformational leadership of government secondary school principals and teachers’ job satisfaction. Though not mentioned in the reviewed article, a descriptive survey research design was employed to attain its objective. The transformational leadership questionnaire and the teachers’ job satisfaction questionnaire were employed as instruments of data collection. Therefore, the reviewer followed theoretical, epistemological and statistical assumptions of quantitative research while critically review the article. Accordingly, despite some flaws existed in the study that might lessen its empirical power and reputation, the study was worthwhile in examining the transformational theoretical leadership paradigm in the Ethiopian context. It was suggested that audiences need to consider its shortfalls while using the study findings and future studies need to consider such inaccuracies.

**Keywords:** Article review, flaws, transformational leadership, job satisfaction

### \*Correspondence to Author:

Eshetu Kibret Emiru  
Debre Markos University

### How to cite this article:

Eshetu Kibret Emiru. Article Critique: “The Relationship between Transformational Leadership and Job Satisfaction” . American Journal of Educational Research and Reviews, 2020,5:69.

 **eSciPub**  
eSciPub LLC, Houston, TX USA.  
Website: <https://escipub.com/>

## **Introduction**

This review aimed at investigating the potencies and flaws of the article published in the title of “The relationship between transformational leadership and job satisfaction: The case of government secondary school teachers in Ethiopia.” The article was published in the “Educational Management Administration & Leadership” journal in its volume 42 number 6 in 2014. It was revealed that transformational leadership had a significant positive moderate relationship with overall teachers’ job satisfaction. In spite of the article was written well, the study has no clearly articulated specific research method and there existed warning signals of multicollinearity problem in the data. These flaws of the article might lead to an inaccurate conclusion and deter its replication.

## **Summary**

Tadele (2014) conducted a study about the relationship between transformational leadership and job satisfaction: the case of government secondary school teachers in Ethiopia. A randomly selected 320 teachers were responded to a three-part instrument (the transformational leadership questionnaire, the teachers’ job satisfaction questionnaire and demographic items). Descriptive statistics, Pearson correlations, and stepwise regression analysis were employed to analyze the data.

The study revealed that a significant positive, moderate relationship between overall transformational leadership and overall teachers’ job satisfaction. Furthermore, a significant positive, moderate relationship exists between each component of transformational leadership and teachers’ job satisfaction.

Therefore, the author suggested principals of government secondary schools in Ethiopia should pay more attention to developing efficient teamwork and the expression of warm concern and trust to co-workers through transformational leadership behaviors.

## **The Methodological Approach**

The reviewer selected the article from the Thomson journal list (using keywords such as leadership, school leadership, school principal, educational leadership) for review and analysis. Hence, the reviewer chooses this study that it appears familiar with the topic and a study that employed a quantitative approach for this review purpose.

## **Critique**

The title of the research is informative and shows the relationship between variables. However, the study was conducted in Addis Ababa, which was purposefully selected by the researcher so that particular reference of the study could be Addis Ababa, instead of Ethiopia.

Relating to the abstract, it provides a concise summary of the whole work such as purpose, population, sampling, instrumentation, findings, and recommendations. However, the study did not deal with the specific research method that the study was employed and lacks a conclusion that is inconsistent with the main abstract components that were suggested by the American Psychological Association Publication Manual (APA, 2010).

In its introduction, the study commences with the imperativeness of leadership for an organization’s goal attainment and attempts to relate to teachers’ job satisfaction. However, it neglects in giving a firm sense about Ethiopian teachers’ work conditions in line with the problem in focus. Moreover, the study overlooks the context in which teachers work and its impact on their job satisfaction by reviewing previous empirical studies in the study area. On the other hand, the study clearly describes the objectives and rationale of the research so that a study was done well in this regard.

The study clearly and concisely addresses the challenges that teachers were facing related to job satisfaction and attempts to coincide with principal leadership behavior. However, it overlooks the gap in the existing literature

regarding the problem identified by reviewing previous studies conducted earlier. Moreover, it fails to notice what is studied, what is found and what is left for his study relating to teachers' job satisfaction and transformational leadership in the Ethiopian context. A researcher must analyze previous studies critically and come up with a problem statement so that s/he should be able to explain why conducting particular research will be useful and what it could contribute to the body of knowledge. If not, as stated by Khalid, Hilman, and Kumar (2012) "if there is no problem, there is no need to conduct research" (p.18).

Concerning its methodology, the researcher overlooks demonstrating the research design and specific method employed in the study. It would be imperative for the researcher to state the design and method used while the research was undertaken. Relating to this, Khalid et al. (2012) asserted that the investigator must inform the type of research design used because it dictates the overall plan of the study. However, the study simply mentioned the target population and sampling technique, instrumentation, data collection and data analysis used in the study. Alternatively, a good action was taken to ensure the reliability and validity of the instruments by undertaking the pilot test and forward and backward translation (from English to Amharic and vice-versa).

The types of data analysis used in the study (descriptive statistics, Pearson product-moment correlation, and regression analysis) were analogous with the research objectives raised. However, data cleaning and normality test could be done before the data analysis in order to make sure about the normal distribution of scores (checking errors and detecting outliers) using graphical and statistical methods (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2013). Moreover, regression analysis is very sensitive to outliers (Pallant, 2010). It would be better to do this for all the independent variables that were used in

the regression analysis. In the reviewed study nothing is reported about it.

Multicollinearity (high correlations among the predictors) could also be tested before running a multiple regression analysis if not the existence of such a problem can lead to inaccurate results (Leech, Barrett, & Morgan, 2015). In the reviewed study warning signals of multicollinearity were observed. Moreover, there were high inter-correlation among predictor variables (between intellectual stimulation and inspirational motivation;  $r=.83$ ), individualized consideration and intellectual stimulation;  $r=.82$ ), and individualized consideration and intellectual stimulation;  $r=.81$ ). If variables are highly correlated (e.g., correlated at .50 or .60 and above) indicates that the predictors contain much of the same information, thus, one might decide to combine them into a composite variable or eliminate one or more of the highly correlated variables (Leech et al, 2015). However, no action was taken in the reviewed study.

Besides, to determine the impact of the five components of transformational leadership on the job satisfaction stepwise regression analysis was used in the study. However, stepwise regression does not take theoretical considerations into account while the researcher assigns an order of entry of variables in the regression equation (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2013). Therefore, it would be better the researcher could use sequential (hierarchical) regression analysis instead.

Pertaining to the result, idealized influence/attribution ( $R^2=.228$ ) and inspirational motivation ( $R^2=.013$ ) dimensions of transformational leadership identified as significant contributors to overall teachers' job satisfaction. This implied that principals' who are role models and inspire become the source of job satisfaction of teachers. However, its recommendations were not in line with the study findings.

Moreover, the recommendations given were not feasible and related with the study findings. For instance, it was found that only two dimensions of transformational leadership had an effect on teacher job satisfaction. However, it was suggested that principals' to be exhibited transformational leadership. Furthermore, the overall observed mean (M=3.25) of principals transformational leadership was found above average. This implied that leaders were exhibiting transformational leadership behavior more than expected so that it would be better offering suggestions on the specific dimensions that had more impacts on job satisfaction of teachers. Again, the study was conducted in a purposefully selected study location; in the secondary school of Addis Ababa. However, the practice of transformational leadership was recommended to be applied in all Ethiopian schools context. Generalization of the research findings is possible for the total population in which the sample was drawn (Fraenkel, Wallen, & Hyun, 2012). In this regard, Polit, and Beck (2010) contended that generalizability is deemed as a major criterion for evaluating the quality of a quantitative study.

## Conclusion

The study revealed the relationship between transformational leadership and teachers' job satisfaction. Hence, the study is worthwhile in examining the transformational theoretical leadership paradigm in the Ethiopian context. However, some flaws exist in the study might minimize its empirical power and reputation so that audiences need to consider its shortfalls (problems such as data cleaning, multicollinearity, and data analysis techniques) while utilizing the study findings and future studies are suggested not to make similar inaccuracies found in this study.

## References

1. American Psychological Association. (2010). *Publication manual of the APA (6<sup>th</sup> ed.)*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.

2. Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2012). *How to design and evaluate research in education(8<sup>th</sup> ed.)*. New York: The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.
3. Khalid, K., Hilman, H., and Kumar, D. (2012). Get along with quantitative research process. *International Journal of Research in Management.2 (2)*, 15-29. Retrieved from: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282283745>.
4. Leech, N.L., Barrett, K.C., & Morgan, G.A. (2015). *SPSS for intermediate statistics: Use and interpretation (5<sup>th</sup> ed.)*. New York, Taylor & Francis.
5. Pallant, J. (2010). *SPSS survival manual: A step by step guide to data analysis using SPSS (4th ed.)*. England: The McGraw Hill Companies.
6. Polit, D. F., & Beck, C. T. (2010). Generalization in quantitative and qualitative research: Myths and strategies. *International journal of nursing studies, 47(11)*, 1451-1458.
7. Tabachnick, B.G., & Fidell, L.S. (2013). *Using multivariate statistics (6<sup>th</sup> ed.)*. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
8. Tadele Akalu (2014). The relationship between transformational leadership and job satisfaction: The case of government secondary school teachers in Ethiopia. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership, 42(6)*, 903-918. doi: 10.1177/1741143214551948

